

**An illuminative evaluation of foster carers' experiences of attending
an Attachment Theory and Practice training programme offered by
a Child and Adolescent Mental Health Service for Looked After
Children.**

By

Mandy Marie Burton

The thesis is submitted in partial fulfilment of the requirements for the
award of the degree of

Professional Doctorate in Nursing
of the
University of Portsmouth.

In collaboration with Solent NHS Trust and Portsmouth City Council

April 2012

ABSTRACT

Background

In 2006, a review of the research and literature in relation to the mental health needs of children in care, led to the rationale for providing training to foster carers and the network of professionals surrounding the child, offered as an integral part of the service provided by a Child and Adolescent Mental Health Service for Looked After Children (CAMHS/LAC) in the South of England. Individuals who are prepared to become foster carers need solid mental health training to successfully parent children who have experienced severe trauma and present with a range of emotional and behavioural difficulties (Dorsey et al 2008). Foster carers expressed the need for more information and support to improve their understanding of mental health issues when caring for their looked after child. In order to meet this need and given the dearth of evaluation within the literature regarding foster carers' experience of attending mental health training, this research study provides an evaluation of the process and outcome of attending training. Understanding the experience of the training from a foster carer's perspective was paramount in order to target support to carers to both prevent placement breakdown, deterioration in childrens' health and emotional wellbeing and for service development

The overall objectives of this research study were to explore the experience of professional foster carers before, during and after receiving training; to evaluate the knowledge gained from the training and explore their perception of how this affected their practice and identify areas of strengths and weaknesses of the training.

Methodology

An in-depth illuminative evaluation for two cohorts of foster carers used a mixed methods approach (quantitative and qualitative) to explore process and outcomes; with the main emphasis upon the comprehensive collection of qualitative data. Quantitative data were collected in the form of two validated questionnaires, the Strengths and Difficulties Questionnaire (SDQ) (Goodman, 1999) and the Family Impact Questionnaire (FIQ) (Donenberg & Baker, 1993), a knowledge questionnaire which was piloted and devised by the researcher and a satisfaction questionnaire devised by the local City Council. Qualitative data took the form of a series of semi structured interviews pre training, immediately post training and twelve weeks follow up training. A diary interview method was also used to complement the data gathered within the follow up interviews (Zimmerman & Weider, 1977).

Results

Results from the quantitative questionnaires suggest that foster carers provide care for foster children in the South of England with a high level of need in relation to their mental health. Overall the SDQ results did not reach statistical significance but suggest a trend towards reduced perceived emotional and behavioural difficulties presented by children in their care. The FIQ identified that both foster children and birth children have a high impact on several areas of family functioning which continued over the twelve week period of the study. Increased knowledge was measured and showed statistically significant differences from baseline, which were retained over time and led to the reported positive change in foster carers' levels of confidence, ability to advocate for their child in a school setting and a sense of empowerment for foster carers.

An interpretive approach to analyzing data was used through the aid of thematic content analysis using the *Framework Approach*. Findings from the qualitative data revealed ten themes and suggested that foster carers experience training as a journey of awareness in relation to understanding the mental health needs of the children in their care.

Conclusion

Illuminative evaluation has provided description and interpretation to unravel the experience of group training, whereby foster carers negotiate, choose and create their own learning in relation to individual needs. There appears to be a move away from foster carers being passive recipients of knowledge towards the proactive creation and sharing of knowledge within which carers from all levels of experience contribute.

Recommendations include a review of the existing package of training, involving the aid of foster carers input, to co-develop appropriate training programmes.

TABLE OF CONTENTS

Title page	Page
	(i)
Abstract	(ii)
Table of contents	(iv)
List of tables	(ix)
List of figures	(x)
Abbreviations	(xi)
Acknowledgements	(xiii)
Dissemination	(xiv)
Declaration	(xv)
Dedication	(xvi)
Chapter 1 Project Background	1
1.1 Introduction	1
1.2 Looked After Children	3
1.2.1 Profile of Children in Care	3
1.2.2 Outcomes for Children in Care	5
1.3 Mental Health of Children in Care	7
1.3.1 National Comparisons of the Mental Health Needs of Children in Care	7
1.3.2 International Comparisons of the Mental Health Needs of Children in Care	9
1.3.3 Mental Health and Stability of Placement	10
1.4 Government Policy	12
1.5 Foster care in the United Kingdom	16
1.5.1 Foster Care	16
1.5.2 Origins of Foster Care Training	16
1.5.3 Standards for Foster Care	18
1.5.4 Charter for Foster Care	19
1.5.5 Dedicated Child and Adolescent Mental Health Services for Children in Care	20
1.6 Literature Review of Training Interventions	21
1.6.1 Search Strategy	21
1.6.2 Training Interventions	22
1.6.2.1 Training Groups: Cognitive Behavioural Programmes	24
1.6.2.2 Training Groups: Treatment Foster Care	27

	Programmes	
1.6.2.3	Training Groups: Mixed model Programmes	28
1.7	Background to Research Project	33
1.7.1	Demographics of a Local Authority in the South of England	33
1.7.2	Children in Care for a Local Authority in the South of England	34
1.7.3	Role of a Child and Adolescent Mental Health Service for Looked After Children (CAMHS/LAC)	35
1.7.4	CAMHS/LAC Foster care training	36
1.8	Conclusion	38
Chapter 2	Methodology	40
2.1	Introduction	40
2.2	Evaluation	40
2.2.1	Illuminative Evaluation	40
2.3	Mixed Methodology	42
2.3.1	Qualitative Approach	42
2.3.2	Reflexivity	43
2.3.3	Quantitative Approach	45
2.3.4	Triangulation	45
2.4	Process of Research Design	48
2.4.1	Sampling Strategy	49
2.4.2	Recruitment	49
2.4.3	Participants	50
2.5	Ethical Approval: Process in Action	50
2.6	Conclusion	52
Chapter 3	Quantitative Approach	54
3.1	Introduction	54
3.2	Data Collection	55
3.2.1	Strength and Difficulties Questionnaire (SDQ)	55
3.2.1.1	Administration	56
3.2.1.2	Scoring	56
3.2.1.3	Validation	57
3.2.2	Family Impact Questionnaire (FIQ)	57
3.2.2.1	Administration	58
3.2.2.2	Scoring	58
3.2.2.3	Validation	59
3.2.3	Knowledge Questionnaire	59
3.2.3.1	Construction and Pilot of the Knowledge Questionnaire	60
3.2.3.2	Administration	61
3.2.3.3	Scoring	61
3.2.3.4	Validation	61
3.2.4	Local Authority Evaluation Questionnaire	61
3.2.4.1	Administration	62
3.2.4.2	Scoring	62

3.2.4.3	Validation	62
3.3	Characteristics of the Research Participants	64
3.3.1	Combined Cohorts	64
3.4	Characteristics of Children	65
3.4.1	Foster Children in Placement	65
3.4.2	Birth Children in Placement	66
3.5	Analysis, Results and Discussion of Quantitative Questionnaires	67
3.5.1	Strength and Difficulties Questionnaire (SDQ)	67
3.5.1.1	Analysis	67
3.5.1.2	Results	68
3.5.1.3	Mean Scores	68
3.5.1.4	Individual SDQ Scores	71
3.5.1.5	Categories of Need	72
3.5.1.6	Discussion: Changes in Perception	75
3.5.1.7	Foster Children	76
3.5.1.8	Birth Children	79
3.5.1.9	Exploring the Data	82
3.5.2	Family Impact Questionnaire	85
3.5.2.1	Analysis	85
3.5.2.2	Results	86
3.5.2.3	Mean Scores	86
3.5.2.4	Discussion: Family Functioning	90
3.5.3	Knowledge Questionnaire	93
3.5.3.1	Analysis	93
3.5.3.2	Results	93
3.5.3.3	Discussion: Sustaining Knowledge over Time	95
3.5.4	Local Authority Evaluation Questionnaire	96
3.5.4.1	Analysis	96
3.5.4.2	Results	96
3.5.4.3	Discussion: High Satisfaction Achieved	98
3.6	Conclusion	99
Chapter 4	Qualitative Approach	100
4.1	Introduction	100
4.2	Data Collection	100
4.2.1	A Diary Interview	101
4.2.2	Semi-structured Interviews	102
4.2.2.1	Interview Schedule	103
4.2.2.2	Pre Training Schedule	103
4.2.2.3	Post Training Schedule	104
4.2.2.4	Follow Up Training Schedule	105
4.2.2.5	Venue	106
4.2.2.6	Audio-recording Equipment	107
4.2.2.7	Transcriptions of Interviews	107
4.2.2.8	Field Notes	108
4.2.2.9	Reflections on Interview Process	108
4.2.2.10	Participant Validation of Interviews	109
4.2.2.11	Validity	109

4.3	Data Analysis	110
4.3.1	Diary Interview Analysis	110
4.3.1.1	Diary Interview Findings	110
4.3.2	Semi-structured Interview Analysis	111
4.3.2.1	Framework Approach	111
4.3.2.2	Stages of Data Analysis	112
4.3.2.3	Stage One: Familiarisation	113
4.3.2.4	Stage Two: Identifying a Thematic Framework	114
4.3.2.5	Stage Three: Indexing	117
4.3.2.6	Stage Four: Charting	118
4.3.2.7	Stage Five: Mapping and Interpretation	119
4.4	Findings from the Qualitative Data	122
4.4.1	Discovery of Themes	124
4.4.2	Starting Out: Pre Training Themes	127
4.4.2.1	Theme One: Motivations	127
4.4.2.2	Theme Two: Expectations	134
4.4.3	Travelling Through: Post Training Themes	140
4.4.3.1	Theme Three: Sharing the Experiences of Others	140
4.4.3.2	Theme Four: Knowledge to ‘Complete the Jigsaw’	146
4.4.3.3	Theme Five: Format and Content	151
4.4.3.4	Theme Six: Personal Issues	156
4.4.4	Moving On: Follow Up Training	158
4.4.4.1	Theme Seven: Understanding the Emotional Needs of Children in Care	158
4.4.4.2	Theme Eight: Personal Insights and the ‘Rippling Effect’	163
4.4.4.3	Theme Nine: Parenting Skills	170
4.4.4.4	Theme Ten: Experience of CAMHS Support and Training	175
4.5	Discussion of Qualitative Findings	179
4.5.1	Journey of Discovery: Ten Themes	179
4.5.1.1	Starting Out: Motivations and Expectations	181
4.5.1.2	Travelling Through: Instant Post Training Reactions	185
4.5.1.3	Moving On: Personal Growth and Reflective Practice	186
4.6	Conclusion	188
Chapter 5	Illuminative Evaluation	189
5.1	Introduction	189
5.2	Discussion and Summary of the Illuminative Evaluation	189
5.2.1	Quantitative Results	190
5.2.2	Qualitative Findings	192
5.2.3	Key Findings	196
5.3	Limitations of the Study	197

Chapter 6	Professional Relevance of the Research and Professional Reflections	202
6.1	Introduction	202
6.2	Practitioner Researcher	203
6.2.1	Suggestions for Further Research	203
6.2.2	Suggestions for Future Professional Clinical Practice	205
6.2.3	Suggestions for the debate on Mental Health Training for Foster Carers	206
6.3	Review of My Professional Development	207
6.4	Future Goals and Aspirations	208
References		209
Appendices		
1	Map of Search Strategy	(xvii)
2	Format for Documenting Evidence Based Papers	(xviii)
3	Content of training Programme	(xix)
4	Satisfaction Questionnaires	(xx)
5	Copy of Quantitative Questionnaires	(xxi)
6	Letter of Introduction	(xxii)
7	Information Sheet	(xxiii)
8	Consent Form	(xxiv)
9	Copy of Ethical Approval	(xxv)
10	Summary of Outcome Tools	(xxvi)
11	Summary of Knowledge Questionnaire Scores	(xxvii)
12	Characteristics of Research Participants: Foster Carers	(xxviii)
13	Visual Comparison of Characteristics of Foster Carers, Foster Children and Birth Children	(xxix)
14	SDQ Tables	(xxx)
15	Copy of Diary	(xxxi)
16	Interview Schedules	(xxxii)
17	Sensitivity Tool	(xxxiii)
18	Example of Pre- Training Charts	(xxxiv)
19	Charts of Themes	(xxxv)
20	Mind Map of Ten Central Themes	(xxxvi)
21	Photograph of Central Chart	(xxxvii)
22	Audit Trail	(xxxviii)
23	ACAMHS Presentation October 2010	(xxxix)
24	Solent NHS Trust Presentation May 2011	(xl)
25	Proposed Research Stages	(xli)

LIST OF TABLES

Chapter	Page
1: Table 1: Age of Children on First Starting to be Looked After 2007 to 2011	4
3: Table 2: Characteristics of Research Participants	65
3: Table 3: Characteristics of Foster Children in Placement	66
3: Table 4: Characteristics of Birth Children in Placement	67
3: Table 5: Comparison of SDQ Mean Scores of Foster Children at Pre Training and Follow Up	68
3: Table 6: Comparison of SDQ Mean Scores of Birth Children at Pre Training and Follow Up	68
3: Table 7: A Repeated Measure Two-Way ANOVA of SDQ Mean Scores	70
3: Table 8: Percentage of Responses for Level of Need Pre and Follow Up SDQ for Foster Children	73
3: Table 9: Percentage of Responses for Level of Need Pre and Follow up SDQ for Birth Children	74
3: Table 10: FIQ Comparison of Means for Foster Children at Pre Training and Follow Up	86
3: Table 11: FIQ Comparison of Means for Birth children at Pre Training and Follow Up	87
3: Table 12: A Repeated Measure Two-Way ANOVA of FIQ Mean Scores	88
3: Table 13: Paired Samples Test	94
3: Table 14: Satisfaction Questionnaire: Foster Carer Responses for each Training Cohort	97
4: Table 15: Five Stages of Data Analysis	112
4: Table 16: Observational and Reflective Field Notes	114
4: Table 17: Initial Index for Themes for Pre-Interviews	115
4: Table 18: Definition of Themes	123

LIST OF FIGURES

Chapter	Page
2: Figure 1: Triangulation	47
2: Figure 2: Research Design Flow Chart	48
3: Figure 3: Comparison of SDQ Subscales Pre and Follow Up For Foster Children	69
3: Figure 4: Comparison of SDQ Subscales Pre and Follow Up For Birth Children	69
3: Figure 5: Total SDQ Scores Pre and Follow Up of Individual Foster Children	71
3: Figure 6: Total SDQ Scores Pre and Follow Up of Individual Birth Children	72
3: Figure 7: Comparison of SDQ Total Difficulty Score Pre and Follow Up of Foster Children	74
3: Figure 8: Comparison of SDQ Total Difficulty Score Pre and Follow Up of Birth Children	75
3: Figure 9: Comparison of FIQ Subscales Pre and Follow Up of Foster Children	87
3: Figure 10: Comparison of FIQ Subscales Pre and Follow Up of Birth Children	88
3: Figure 11: A Significant Interaction FIQ Positive Feelings Subscales for Birth and Foster Children.	89
3: Figure 12: Comparison of Mean Knowledge Scores Pre Post and Follow Up	94
4: Figure 13: An Example of Pre Training Charts developed from the Index	118
4: Figure 14: Mind Map of Theme One	120
4: Figure 15: Photograph of Theme Nine in Original Format	120
4: Figure 16: Photograph of a Section of the Central Chart	121
4: Figure 17: Conceptual Framework: Over-arching Journey for Foster Carers Experiencing Mental Health Training	125
4: Figure 18: Photograph of Mind Map of Conceptual Framework in its Original Format	126
4: Figure 19: Stages Through Training for New Foster Carers	180
4: Figure 20: Stages Through Training for Experienced Foster Carers	180

ABBREVIATIONS

ACAMHS	Association for Child and Adolescent Mental Health Service
AMED	Allied and Complementary Medicine
ANOVA	Analysis of Variance
ASSIA	Applied Social sciences Index
BME	Black and Minority Ethnic
BNI	British Nursing Index
CAMHS	Child and Adolescent Mental Health Service
CBCL	Child Behaviour Check List
CINAHL	Cumulative Index to Nursing and Allied Healthcare Literature
CSA	Care Standards Act
CWDC	Children's Workforce and Development Council
DAAT	Drug and Alcohol Action Team
DCSF	Department for Children, Schools and Families
DfE	Department for Education
DfES	Department of Education and Skills
DH	Department of Health
EBP	Evidence Based Practice
FIQ	Family Impact Questionnaire
GCSE	General Certificate of Secondary Education
IBBS	International Bibliography of the Social Sciences
IMD	Index of Multiple Deprivations
KSF	Knowledge and Skills Framework
LAC	Looked After Children
MTFC	Multidimensional Treatment Foster Care
MRS	Modified Rosenberg Scale
MSC	Masters of Science
NHS	National Health Service
NICE	National Institute for Health and Clinical Excellence
NVQ	National Vocational Qualification
NMC	Nursing and Midwifery Council
ONS	Office for National Statistics
PACE	Playfulness Acceptance Curiosity Empathy
PCC	Portsmouth City Council
PCT	Primary Care Trust
PICOT	Population, Intervention, Comparison, Outcome, Time
PSI	Parenting Stress Index
RAD	Reactive Attachment Disorder
RGF	Research Governance Framework
SCIE	Social Care Institute for Excellence
SDQ	Strengths and Difficulties Questionnaire
SHSSW	School of Health and Science and Social Work
SPSS	Statistical Package for the Social Sciences

SSCI
UK
USA

Social Science Citation Index
United Kingdom
United States of America

ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS

My love and thanks to Jason, who has kept me company throughout this marathon, whose humour, patience and endless support has carried me through. To my children, Frank and Kittie, you are my inspiration, thanks for your love, hugs and encouragement 'Never Never Give Up!'

I would like to thank all the foster carers who took part in this research within their own time and who show such courage, love and commitment to the children they care for.

I would like to thank my nursing colleague Fiona Giddey who developed and created the training groups with me and has given me her support, encouragement and patience throughout the process of completing this research. Her friendship, sense of humour and taste in shoes has kept me going!

I am very grateful to my managers Sonia King and Anne Fleming who have supported me in many ways both practically and emotionally. Thank you for giving me the time to complete this project. My thanks also for all the support from Isabel Aylott who transcribed the interviews and Alison Marks who was there supporting me through the years.

My sincerest thanks to Dr Ann Dewey, for her advice, guidance and detailed feedback, which has helped me throughout the last 5 years. I am so grateful to her for her encouragement to go that extra mile.

I am also very grateful to Dr Catherine Powell for her academic and clinical support during the Professional Doctorate in Nursing. Her enthusiasm for the area of practice and her critical appraisal led to a more creative thesis.

Thanks also to Dr Rebecca Stores for her support in reporting the quantitative data. I learnt so much in such a short space of time. Also my thanks to Dr Graham Mills, for his encouragement in staying in touch with my peers and Mrs Charlotte Roberts for her advice throughout the professional doctorate programme.

My thanks also to colleagues in social care who have helped me facilitate this research and in health who have listened to my anxieties and encouraged me to keep going.

My special thanks to my family and friends Thomas, Collette, Alan, Pat, Martin, Bridget, Munni, Tracy and Jools who have listened to me over the last five years and have given me so much love and encouragement. Finally my love and thanks also to my mum for helping me fulfil my dreams and for being there every step of the way. You are an amazing mum!

DISSEMINATION

Presentation: ACAMHS Special Interest group for Looked After Children. London 18th October 2010 (see Appendix 23)

Presentation: Solent NHS Celebration of Good Practice. Portsmouth 25th May 2011 (see Appendix 24)

Presentation: Nurses Forum. My Professional Doctorate Journey. Portsmouth 7th November 2011.

DECLARATION

I declare that whilst studying for the Doctorate in Nursing at the University of Portsmouth I have not been registered for any other award at another University. The work undertaken for this degree has not been submitted elsewhere for another award. The work contained in this project report is my own work.

Word Count: 53,213

DEDICATION

This work is dedicated to the memory of my baby sister Barbara who never got the chance to fulfil her ambitions.